Developing Children's Supplementary Literature Book Based On Character Education In Sixth Grade Of Elementary School

by Rizka Nur Oktaviani

Submission date: 28-Jul-2018 12:58AM (UTC+0700) Submission ID: 1875884821 File name: EST_Rizka_Endah_2018.pdf (1.03M)Word count: 4989 Character count: 27780

5 Journal of Educational Science and Technology *Volume 4 Number 2 August 2018 page 28-35 p-ISSN:2460-1497 and e-ISSN: 2477-3840 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.26858/est_v4i2.6065*

Developing Children's Supplementary Literature Book Based On Character Education In Sixth Grade Of Elementary School

Rizka Nur Oktaviani¹, Endah Wening Subekti²

¹ Elementary School Study Program, Stkip Bina Insan Mandiri Surabaya Email:rizkanuroktaviani@stkipbim.ac.id
² Elementary School Study Program, STKIP Bina Insan Mandiri Surabaya

Email:endahwenings@gmail.com

(Received: July-2018; Reviewed: July-2018; Revised: July-2018; Accepted: August-2018; Published: August-2018)

©2018 – EST Graduate Program Universitas Negeri Makassar. This is an article with open access under license CC BY-NC-4.0 (<u>https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/</u>).

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to develop children's supplementary literature bitk based on character education. This study described the process and quality in developing supplementary literature book based on character education. The quality of this book was reviewed based on the product and its use in the classroom. This study used a mixed method of qualitative and quantitative sequential exploratory model and 4D developmental model. The Developmental model consisted of defining, designing, and developing phases. The results showed that development process includes the defining stage by mapping learning needs as a result; the design stage with a draft of the book as aresult; and the development stage with the final model of children's develop children's supplementary literature book based on character education as a result. The quality of the book was known to form its component score. All categories were categorized as very eligible. The result of observations was 97% in teacher activity, 93% in teacher response, 95% student activity, and 96% in student responses. Based on learning mastery, students learning outcome was more than 72. Therefore, it can be concluded that the developed children's supplementary literature book based on character education was very feasible to use.

Keywords: Supplementary Book; Children's; Literature; Character Education.

INTRODUCTION

Harsanti (2017: 625) described Literature as a reflection of the socio-cultural conditions of the nation which must be inherited to the young generation (next generation). Through the learning literature, student will learn about the intellectual of conceptual culture and face it in the concrete situation or life model at once. Moreover it can be seen as culture in action, for example, reading Indonesian literature meant as learning the Indonesian nation's life (Harsanti, 2017: 625).

The Purpose of literary learning in elementary school is to develop students' language, personality, and social skills. Students' development can be seen when they try to express emotions, and feelings into a literary work. The values contained in the literary material are perceived a students and unconsciously reconstruct their attitudes and personality in the daily life. This is because the values and morals in the literary material are not presented directly, but through the story and language style so that the educational process on literary learning is fun and not patronizing (Noor, 2001: 44). Frye (2002:54) described character education can be inserted through several subjects are poems, novels, biographies, autobiographies, short stories, plays, essays, etc.

Thus, literary material are very effective to help to implant students' value, morals, and character. The low learning achievement of Indonesian language and literature in sixth grade at most of the elementary school in the district of Semampir especially at SDN Wonokusumo I / 40 Surabaya showed that the average score of this lesson was 69,14 and there were 66% of students who did not complete the learning mastery of 75. This was influenced by several factors: students did not actively involve in a learning process in the classroom, where some students still imitated the teacher, tended to rewrite the teacher's words about the material. In addition, textbooks used by students were not complete so that there was a misconception of the material. This could be proved from students' less understanding in the difference of Malayan poetry (Pantun) and poetry when doing National Examination based questions. Some students were not able to determine the characteristics of each character in the drama and determine the main character in a scene of the drama script. Based on the basic competence in the regulation of National Education Ministry No.57 of 2014, as well as students' textbooks issued by the Education and a Culture Ministry, it was found that literary material was very less. In fact, textbooks used by students contained more non-literary texts that are subjected to science and social science lessons. Meanwhile, there was also a story of historical fiction that showed implantation of heroic character but not equipped with honest character, responsibility and politeness. It was getting worse when there were no supplementary books to support literary material in Indonesian language and literature lesson. Based on the findings, the writers wire interested to make a children's studv entitled "Developing supplementary literature book based on character education in sixth grade of elementary school".

Based on the background of problems, the research questions could be formulated as follows: 1) how is the process of developing the children's supplementary literature book based on character education in sixth grade of elementary school?, 2) how is quality of material fasibility, presentation, language and grammar children's supplementary literature book based on character education in sixth grade of elementary fichool? 3) how is feasibility of developed children's supplementary literature book based on character education in sixth grade of elementary school? The three research questions could be broken down into two subproblems viewed from the teacher's point of view_2nd the students' point of view.

The purpose of this study was to describe the process of developing the quality of children's developed supplementary literature book based on character education in the sixth grade of elementary school. The benefits of study were expected to contribute to Indonesian language and literature learning activities, references for libraries, and new information about literary materials in the context of making children's supplementary literature book based on character education, especially to complement learning tools for students as well as mput for teachers. The results of this study were children's supplementary literature book based on character education in the sixth grade of elmentary school. The children'ssupplementary literature book based on character education in the sixth grade of elementary school was prepared based on the 2013 curriculum where the book consisted of title page, introduction, book reading guide, table of contents, teaching materials, references, glossary, and index, while the physical form of supplementary book developed in this study was printed book with sized 80 gram A4 standard ISO which has length and standard width (21 \times 29.7 cm), the numbers of pages was more than 70 with 1,5 line spacing. The glossary paper was used for cover, the table of contents and the contents of the book printed in color ink. The font for the contents of the book are comic san MS with the size of 18 points (pt) on the title of the book, comic sans 12 pt on the part content / body text, 14 pt on subtitles, and on the description of the image (exposure) using century gothic font letter with the size of 10 pt.

METHOD

The type of this study was research and development. This research is a process or steps to develop a new product or to improve the existing products that can be accounted for (Sukmadinata, 2005: 164). The approach used a mixed method of qualitative and quantitative exploratory. The sequential sequential exploratory model is a combination of research method that combined qualitative and quantitative research methods (Sugiyono, 2013: 415). This research design refers to the 4D Model. This development model consisted of four development stages: define, design, development and disseminate (Thiagarajan in Trianto, 2007: 65). In this study, the development of children's supplementary literature book based on character education was adapted only to the development stage, so that the developed products were only used in trial school, without being issued and used to other schools. The defining stage aimed to establish and define the requirements for preparing a book of supplements. There were 2ve key steps in the defining phase such as final preliminary analysis, student analysis, concept analysis, task analysis, and objective learning analysis.

At the design stage, this supplementary book was prepared and written by the requirements of National Professional Certification Authority 2007 to pay attention to the feasibility of content, language feasibility, the feasibility of presentation, and the feasibility of graphic. The children's literary book that has been written and compiled was the first draft of the children's supplementary literature book based on character education for sixth graders in elementary school. The next process was book validation by the team of validators to test its feasibility. Assessment, feedback, and suggestions used to revise draft I. Based on validator's input, the initial draft of developed book was revised. The result of this revision was called draft II. Draft II was given back to the validator to be assessed. The result of a revision in draft II would be called draft III. The activity continued with a limited and extensive tests.

Data in this study were, (1) data taken from the result of defining and design stages. Data of the define stage was the formulation of core competence (CC) and Basic competence (BC). The result of the design stage was assessment from the validator team for the draft I of children's supplementary literature book. The result of the development stage was an assessment of the validator team for draft II and the book valuation data from the teacher's and students' perspective, (2) the data of book quality was assessed by validator and the prospective users (a) the results of the draft II validation of children's book for material feasibility, language, presentation and graphic were used as data to answer the quality issue of this book as product (b) the data of teacher analysis, student analysis and student learning outcomes as well as the limited or extensive test were used as data for the quality of the book feasibility.

Sources of data in this study were, (1) data source at development process was the contents standard in Curriculum 2013 (2) data source from the quality assessment of children's literary book based on character education were 51 respondents consisting of 1 validator for language, 1 validator of presentation aspect, 1 validator for graphic, 51 candidate users consisted of 1 teacher and 20 students of sixth grade at SDN Wonokusumo I / 40 Surabaya in the limited trial, and 1 teacher and 30 students of sixth grade at SDN Wonokusumo I / 40 Surabaya for the extensive test.

Data collection techniques used in this study were documentation, validation, observation, questionnaires, and students learning outcomes. The research instrument used in this study were mapping sheet of CC, BS and indicators; resource acquisition sheet; validation sheet of children's supplementary literature book based on character education in terms of material feasibility, presentation, language, and grahics; observation sheets on teacher activity during the use of children's supplementary literature book draft based on character education; a questionnaire on the teacher's use of the book's response; observation sheets on student activities during the use of children's supplementary literature book draft based on character education; sheets of student learning outcomes seen from the learning mastery; and a questionnaire on student's response to the use of the book.poop[o

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

This study used 4D development model adopted from Thiagarajan which included four stages; defining, design, development, and dissemination. However, this study ended in the development stage because of the limitations of time and cost, so that the book developed was only used in schools without being distributed to other schools. The result obtained in the process of developing the book was the product of dolining, designing and development stages. The defining stage aimed to determine and define learning needs by analyzing the objectives and the material to be developed. This stage consisted of five stages, such as preliminary analysis, student analysis, concept analysis, task analysis, and learning objective analysis. The design stage aimed to get the initial draft of developed children's supplementary literature book based on character education. The results of this design stage was the initial draft of children's

supplementary literature book based on character education as draft 1. This stage included the preparation of the script and early design of children's supplementary literature book based on character education. This design stage was implemented for three months. The material and initial draft of children's supplementary literature book based on character education were compiled and designed in this design stage as a draft 1. Writing and compiling the draft 1 were main activities in term of collecting the materials and formulating the ideas related to the literary material listed on CC and BC which contained character education. The material and language were validated by experts in the field of Indonesian language and literature learning. Meanwhile, validators who validated the feasibility of presentation was an expert in the field of learning, while validators validated graphic was expert in the field of graphic design.

The validity result of the material feasibility component was 92%, meaning that it was categorized as very feasible with a few revisions needed. The feasibility of presentation was 95% meaning that it very feasible with little revision. The language feasibility component was 93%, meaning that it was very feasible with a few revisions. The eligibility component of graphic was 83% meaning that it was properly used with a few revisions.

The next step was the development stage was conducted to produce children's literary supplementary book. At this stage, writers revised results of each validator. The result of revision I of the draft I was then submitted to the validator team consisting of material, presentation, language and the graphic experts. At this stage, several things done can be described as follows: (a) revision of validation result of draft I, (b) validation of children's supplementary literature book as draft II, (c) revision of draft II validation result, (d) limited test, (d) extensive test.

The quality of children's supplementary literature book could be seen from products and its use in the classroom. The product of the children's supplementary literature book was validated by several materials, presentation, language, and graphic experts. Meanwhile, the quality of children's supplementary literature book usage was assessed based on teacher activity, teacher response, student activity, student response, and student learning outcomes. The result of data analysis on product quality children's supplementary literature book was obtained in the development stage. Here, revisions I to draft II, validation of draft II, revising draft II to draft III of the book were conducted. Then, the limited test and extensive test of draft III were conducted as an implementation activity. The final step of the final model was quality of children's supplementary literature book based on character education.

The quality of the book as the product was obtained from some suggestions and input given by some validators. Then, the writer conducted revision I of the draft I, the revision I into draft II. Before writers performed limited test, draft II of the book was given to validate by the team of validators to assess its feasibility. The results of the assessment for the draft I and II of the book was based on material feasibility, presentation, language and graphics as presented in table 4.1

Tabel 4.1	The validation result of feasibility of children's supplementary literature book
	based on character education

Result	Material Presentation Validity Validity		Language Validity	Graphic Validity	
Defining Stage	92%	95%	93%	83%	
Development Stage	96%	98%	97%	89%	
Average	94%	97%	95%	86%	
Average Score	Very High Quality	Very High Quality	Very High Quality	Very High Quality	

The validation result of draft II was revised again according to the input and suggestion from the validator team. Revising the draft II of textbook into draft III was done to get the approval from the team validator. After approval and revision, the draft III of the book was ready for limited test.

The quality of the book in terms of its usage could be seen from the teachers and students respose analysis. The feasibility test of book was conducted on a limited and extensive test. The feasibility of supplementary literature book from the teacher's perspective was seen from the results of teacher activity, teacher response, student activity, and student's response on the book. The teacher activity and student activity was observed by two observers namely teachers at VI A class and VI B class. Observers observed all teacher activity both in limited and extensive test. Meanwhile. observations of teacher activities. teacher responses. student activities, and student responses were recapitulated in percentage rates as well as limited and extensive test presented in Table 4.2.

 Tabel 4.2 Results of Recapitulation of Teacher Activity, Teacher Response, Student Activity, and Student Response at Limited and Extensive Test

Results of Recapitulation	Teacher Activity	Teacher Response	, Student Activity	Student Response
Limited Test	95%	92%	93%	95%
Extensive Test	98%	94%	96%	97%
Average score	97%	93%	95%	96%

The observation results of the limited test were used as reflections to make more active literary learning in the extensive test. Thus it can be concluded that the activity of teachers in children's literacy learning was very active because the percentage limit obtained for teacher activity was 80% - 100% categorized as very good criteria. In this study, the questionnaire of teacher responses was given on a limited test for the sixth grade A teacher while the extensive test was given to sixth grade B teacher at SDN Wonokusumo I / 40 Surabaya. Based on table 4.2, the analysis of teacher responses on children's supplementary literature book was obtained 93%, categorized with positive response criteria.

The quality of children's literature **11**k based on the students' point of view was seen from the results of student activities, and student responses, and student learning outcomes during the use of a book. Based on table 4.2, the results of the recapitulation of student activities and student responses during the limited and extensive test had increased. The average result of student activity was 95%, while for the average result of the student response at limited

and extensive test was 96% with positive response criterion.

To know the students' achievement level of students in learning literature by using children's literature book based on character education showed the students' score before and after using the book. The learning mastery for Indonesian language and literature was ≥ 72 . The student learning outcomes in the limited and extensive test were 84.5, meaning that it was more than the learning mastery ≥ 72 .

Teacher responses, student responses, and student learning outcomes showed that the use of the book obtained positive responses and student learning outcomes increased. in addition, the students also acquired knowledge about new children's literary materials and could motivate students to apply the positive character in everyday life. After conducting the extensive test, the draft III of the developed book has revised again to improve the perfect book. The result of the draft III revision was called the final model of children's supplementary literature learning book based on character education.

Discussion

There was a bit of difficulty in compiling children's supplementary literature book because writers should analyze the needs of supplement book. The first step in the making this book was to analyze the curriculum of 2013, learning resources or teaching materials to complete the deficiencies in the learning resources, and to analyze the characteristics of the students of class VI. The next step is to map the literary material with the selection of language samples, illustrations, and colors. According to Parera (in Yulianto, 2008: 8), the selected language samples should be considered like language learning process, the development of students' language learning, student experience, and context. After mapping the material, the integration of characters and literary learning was done. the characters in this study were respectful, responsible, honest, love the homeland, and caring environment while literary material were Malayan Poetry (Pantun), poetry, story, and drama as theory stated by Skinner (in Suyono, 2011: 63) about education based literary learning. The stimulus given through learning the literary material contained a positive character in everyday life. But, the obstacles occurred when compiling the book because the book based on characters was not easy to make moreover it should be connected to items criteria of the national examination of 2018.

In addition, study literature will provide an understanding of values/characters more in the daily life. The understanding can come from our life's journey, the secrets of life, the discovery, and the disclosure of human characters, and other information that enrich students' knowledge and understanding (Waryanti, 2015: 59). In learning, Literature can be utilized as a media that can be exploited in a respective and expressive. Expressive learning in the implementation of character education is needed, students will be educated to manage the emotions, feelings, opinions, ideas, thought, and viewpoints to internalized themselves and create it into the literary works such as poetry, poem, drama, novel, and short story (Wulandari, 2015: 69).

The process of producing this book referred to textbook was based on National Professional Certification Authority. The book developed was the supplementary book based on children's literature for a curriculum of 2013 based textbooks. The problems occurred because literary learning and characters in a curriculum of 2013 needed to be equipped both in regarding quality and quantity. According to Djuanda's researched (2014: 200), Literature material in 6th grade is contained more non-literary texts of Science and Social Studies for Indonesian lesson so. Literature material is more difficult to teach because Basic Competence (KD) of Indonesian Lesson in 1st to 6th grades have Science and Social Studies contents. Based on the research's result of Sufanti (2013:39) found that Curriculum design of 2013 did not notice about literary and non-literary text in it and there was no comparison in each school level, the finding in 2013 Curriculum textbook was found 28 texts, containing 7 literary texts (25%) and 21 nonliterary texts (75%).

According to Muslich's suggestion (2010:34) about the right book for children must support the learning process in school. Even, Mintowati (2008) suggested, to select the contextual material submitted on an interrelated topic. After preparing the book, the next step was the validation of a book draft conducted to test its feasibility based on material feasibility, presentation, language, and the graphic. The results of material validation, presentation, language, and graphic recapitulation at the defining stage up to the development stage increased. It could be seen in table 4.1 that showed very high-quality criteria with little revision. Based on the guideline and standard of National Professional Certification Authority, a good result could be seen from the quality of product development. The quality of developed textbook as products referred to the quality of the book based on MoNE assessment (2007: 21) in term of material or content, language, presentation, and graphics.

Before performing the limited test, the book had to pass several revisions to get a good quality so that it can be used in learning. Gooch (2012) explains that the test is aimed to collect additional information relating to products developed through the expert evaluation as well as field evaluation. After validation, the children's supplementary literature book could be used in the test. Based on the research that has been done, the children's supplementary literature book could help the teacher as an alternative in carrying out the literary learning and as a reference for literary based on the item criteria of national examination in elementary school 2018. Based on the observations made in the limited test phase and extensive test, it was found that teachers had no difficulty have literary materials so that teachers could teach literary learning in the learning process more easily.

Study research of Irawati (2013: 170) explained that developing Indonesian textbook is able to help teachers to teach character education and culture for the students as well as helping the teachers to build their students' understanding to achieve their Competence Standard (SK) and Basic Competence (KD) completely. The development of Indonesian textbooks can be achieved by multiplying the portion of children's literature in Indonesian textbooks to complement the 2013 Curriculum textbook. The use of children's supplementary literature book could help teachers in teaching literary material in the classroom. It could be seen from the result of teacher activity on limited test at VIA class of 95%, categorized as very active criterion while VIB class teacher got 86% in term of teacher activity, categorized very active criterion. This is in accordance with the opinion of Arikunto (2006: 40) teacher activity was in the interval 85% -100% with very active criteria. Based on percentages in the limited and extensive test, using this book could help teachers in the literary learning.

Based on research at SDN Wonokusumo I/40 Surabaya, it could be seen that children's supplementary literature book based on character education improved motivation and learning outcomes in learning literature. The students' active activity could be seen by their enthusiasm towards literary learning. It could be proved from their score in term of student activity during the limited test was 93% with very active criteria, whereas 96% with very active criteria during the extensive test. The student learning outcomes also increased whose average score was 84.5 more than learning mastery of 72. Based on the above explanation, it was concluded that children's supplementary literature book could motivate students in improving learning outcomes in learning literature.

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

It can be concluded that product is developed through three stages of the defining, design, and development. The defining stage includes live basic steps that must be done, namely preliminary analysis, student analysis, concept analysis, task analysis, and objective learning analysis. The design stage includes the writing and preparation of supplement book and validation of draft I. Development stage includes revision of draft I validation result, validation of draft II of supplementary book, revision of draft II into draft III, limited and extensive test. The quality of supplementary books is valued in terms of products and use in the classroom. In terms of products, the supplementary books are assessed from its material, presentation, language, and graphic components. The material component gets a percentage score of 94%. The presentation component gets 97%. Language component gets percentage 95%. Graphic Component gets 86%. From the validators, the result of assessment was a very quality criterion. Meanwhile, the quality in term of book usage was distinguished based on the teacher's point of view and student's point of view. The results of teacher activity during the process of literature learning using book in a limited and extensive test was 95% and 98% with the very active category. While the teacher response after using children's supplementary literature books based on character education on literary learning showed very positive results or responses on the limited and extensive test with 92% and 94%. Thus, it can be said that the average score of teacher responses was 93% with a positive response criterion.

The quality of book use based on the perspective of students was from student activities, student responses, and learning outcomes. The activity of students during the literary learning process by using book in a limited and extensive test was 93% and 96% with a very active category, while the results of student's responses to book were 95% and 97% with positive response criteria. The average score of student learning outcomes in the literary process after learning using children's supplementary literature books based on character education was 84.5 where the minimum learning mastery was 72.

RERERENCES

- Depdiknas. (2007). Kurikulum Tingkat Satuan Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar. Jakarta: Depdiknas
- Djuanda. (2014). Pembelajaran Ssatra Di SD Dalam Gamitan Kurikulum 2013. Mimbar Sekolah Dasar: ejournal.upi.edu. VOL 1, No 2: hal. 191-200

7

- Frye, Mike, et.al. (2002). Character Education: Informational Handbook & Guide for Support and Implementation of the Student Citizen Act of 2001, North Carolina: State Board of Education, Department of Public Instruction, Division of Instructional Service.
- Gooch, Deanna L. (2012). Research, Development, And Validation of a School Leader's Resource Guide For The Facilitation of Social Media Use by School Staff. Kansas: Kansas State University.
- Harsanti, Arni Gemilang. (2017) Pendidikan Karakter Melalui Pembelajaran Sastra. Makalah disajikan dalam Seminar Nasional#3 Bahasa dan Sastra Indonesia dalan Konteks Global. Universitas negeri 12nber, 22 Maret. Diakses di https://jurnal.unej.ac.id/index.php/fkipepro/article/view/4936/3642
- Irawati, Retno Purnama. (2013). Bahan Ajar Bahasa Indonesia Tematik Berkarakter Dan Berbudaya Dengan Sastra Anak Bagi Siswa SD. Varia Pendidikan: publikasiilmiah.ums.ac.id. Volume 25 No.2.: hal.157-171
- Mintowati, M. (2008). Tuturan Penyandang Autis (Kajian Tindak Tutur, Prinsip Kooperatif, dan Strategis. Disertasi tidak diterbitkan. Surabaya: Universitas Negeri Surabaya
- Muslich, Masnur. (2010). Text Book Writing: Dasar-Dasar Pemahaman, Penulisan, dan Pemakaian Buku Teks. Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media

- Noor, Rohimah. (2011). *Pendidikan Karakter Berbasis Sastra*. Yogyakarta: Ar- Razz Media
- Sufanti, Main. (2013). Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Berbasik Teks: Belajar dari Ohio Amerika Serikat. Makalah disajikan dalam Seminar Nasional: Teks Sebagai Media Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia dalam menyonsong Kurikulum 2013. Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, 01 Juni.
- Sukmadinata, Nana Syaodih. (2011). Metode Penelitian Pendidikan. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya
- Sugiyono. (2013). Met 3/e Penelitian Kombinasi (Mixed Methods). Bandung: Alfabeta
- Suyono & Hariyanto. (2011). Belajar dan Pembelajaran: Teori dan Konsep. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya
- Trianto. (2007). *Model Pembelajaran Terpadu dalam Teori dan Praktek*. Jakarta: Prestasi Pustaka Publisher.
- Waryanti, Endang. (2015). Pembelajaran Sastra Berbasis Karakter. Journal Buana Bastra: journal.unipasby.ac.id. Volume 2 No.2: hal 155-164
- Wulandari, Ririn Ayu. (2015). Sastra Dalam Pembentukan Karakter Siswa. Journal Edukasi Kultura: Jurnal unimed.ac.id Volume 1, No.2.: hal. 63-73
- Yulianto, Bambang. 2008. Aspek Kebahasaan dan Pembelajarannya. Surabaya: Unesa University Press.

Developing Children's Supplementary Literature Book Based On Character Education In Sixth Grade Of Elementary School

ORIGINALITY REPORT

Ο				0	
SIMILA	% ARITY INDEX	% INTERNET SOURCES	% PUBLICATIONS	9% STUDENT PAI	PERS
PRIMAR	Y SOURCES				
1	Submitte Student Paper	ed to Academic	Library Conso	rtium	3%
2		ed to Universita iversity of Sura	U	baya The	1%
3	Submitte Surakart Student Paper	ed to Universita a	s Muhammad	iyah	1 %
4	Submitte Indonesi Student Paper	ed to Universita a	s Pendidikan		1 %
5	Submitte Indonesi Student Paper	ed to Fakultas E a	konomi Unive	rsitas	1 %
6	Submitte Student Paper	ed to Mount Ke	nya University		1%
7	Submitte Student Paper	ed to University	of Nottinghar	n	<1%

8	Submitted to Universitas Putera Indonesia YPTK Padang Student Paper	<1 %
9	Submitted to Direktorat Pendidikan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Kementerian Agama Student Paper	<1%
10	Submitted to Universitas Jember Student Paper	<1 %
11	Submitted to Universiti Teknologi Malaysia Student Paper	<1%
12	Submitted to Universitas Indonesia Student Paper	<1%
13	Submitted to Universitas Muria Kudus Student Paper	<1%

Exclude quotes	Off	Exclude matches	Off
Exclude bibliography	Off		